

Evaluation Form - RFP #10-123 - Revised Proposal / Pricing
Full Service Elevator and Maintenance

| | Total Points | Kone | Otis | Thyssen Krupp |
|--|--------------|-------|-------|---------------|
| Tab I. Proposed Business Plan (20 Points) | 20 | | | |
| (see page 37 of the RFP) | | | | |
| 1. Detailed Approach (15) | 15 | 5.00 | 14.00 | 7.00 |
| 2. Quality assurance plan (3) | 3 | 1.00 | 3.00 | 2.00 |
| 3. Potential risks (2) | 2 | 0.00 | 2.00 | 1.00 |
| | Total | 6.00 | 19.00 | 10.00 |
| Tab II. Experience and Qualifications (20 Points) | 20 | | | |
| (see pages 37 and 38 of the RFP) | | | | |
| 1. Specific qualifications (6) | 6 | 4.00 | 6.00 | 4.00 |
| 2. Relevant experience (6) | 6 | 5.00 | 5.00 | 5.00 |
| 3. Proposed team (4) | 4 | 2.00 | 4.00 | 2.00 |
| 4. License(s) and certification(s) (4) | 4 | | | |
| | Total | 11.00 | 15.00 | 11.00 |
| Tab III. Cost (35 Points) | 35 | | | |
| (see page 38 of the RFP) | Total | 35.00 | 27.00 | 35.00 |
| Tab IV. Capacity and Ability (10 Points) | 10 | | | |
| (see page 38 of the RFP) | | | | |
| 1. Understanding of the delivery requirements (3) | 3 | 0.00 | 3.00 | 2.00 |
| 2. Structured to ensure timely delivery (3) | 3 | 1.00 | 3.00 | 2.00 |
| 3. Company's capacity to service (4) | 4 | 1.00 | 4.00 | 3.00 |
| | Total | 2.00 | 10.00 | 7.00 |
| Tab V. Past Performance & References (5 Points) | 5 | | | |
| (see pages 38 and 39 of the RFP) | Total | 5.00 | 4.00 | 4.00 |
| Tab VI. Small Businesses (10 Points) | 10 | | | |
| (see page 40 of the RFP) | Total | 10.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |

69.00 75.00 67.00

Cost

Kone

Kone - Revised

Otis

Otis - Revised

ThyssenKrupp

ThyssenKrupp - Revised

Past performance and references

Kone

Otis

ThyssenKrupp

\$17,664 Month, Mechanic \$112.96, Helper \$95.31, Materials discount %50

\$12,165

\$113,100 Month (\$28,600 alternate pricing) Mechanic \$150.00, Helper \$100

\$15,830 Mechanic \$150.00, Helper \$100

\$23,109 Month,

\$12,169.22 Mechanic \$155.10, Helper \$134.30

Kone provided ten references one being the has the State of Tennessee contract which is more in line with what this rfp is for. All references checked were acceptable.
Otis provided ten references with Baptist Hospital appearing to be the largest single contract. All references checked were acceptable
ThyssenKrupp provided ten references with Vanderbilt Hospital appearing to be the largest single contract. All references checked were acceptable.

Evaluation Form - RFP #10-123

Full Service Elevator and Maintenance Consensus Scores

| | Total Points | Kone | Otis | Thyssen Krupp |
|--|-------------------------|-------------|-------------|--------------------------|
| Tab I. Proposed Business Plan (20 Points) | 20 | | | |
| (see page 37 of the RFP) | | | | |
| 1. Detailed Approach (15) | 15 | | | |
| 2. Quality assurance plan (3) | 3 | | | |
| 3. Potential risks (2) | 2 | | | |
| | Total | 8.50 | 19.50 | 10.50 |
| Tab II. Experience and Qualifications (20 Points) | 20 | | | |
| (see pages 37 and 38 of the RFP) | | | | |
| 1. <input type="checkbox"/> Specific qualifications (6) | 6 | | | |
| 2. Relevant experience (6) | 6 | | | |
| 3. Proposed team (4) | 4 | | | |
| 4. License(s) and certification(s) (4) | 4 | | | |
| | Total | 13.00 | 20.00 | 12.00 |
| Tab III. Cost (35 Points) | 35 | | | |
| (see page 38 of the RFP) | Total | 35.00 | 27.00 | 34.00 |
| Tab IV. Capacity and Ability (10 Points) | 10 | | | |
| (see page 38 of the RFP) | | | | |
| 1. Understanding of the delivery requirements (3) | 3 | | | |
| 2. Structured to ensure timely delivery (3) | 3 | | | |
| 3. Company's capacity to service (4) | 4 | | | |
| | Total | 6.00 | 10.00 | 5.00 |
| Tab V. Past Performance & References (5 Points) | 5 | | | |
| (see pages 38 and 39 of the RFP) | Total | 5.00 | 4.00 | 4.00 |
| Tab VI. Small Businesses (10 Points) | 10 | | | |
| (see page 40 of the RFP) | Total | 10.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| | | 77.50 | 80.50 | 65.50 |