EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEMBER STATEMENT

Solicitation No. RFP # 19-06 Auctioneer Services

Dear Committee Member:

You have been selected to participate in the evaluation of proposals that have been received as the result of the above referenced solicitation. Your selection was based upon your qualifications in this area and your ability to develop an objective analysis of each proposal.

It is essential that the integrity of the evaluation process be maintained to insure that each offeror is given fair and equal consideration. Familiarity with particular companies and/or individuals may tend to influence an evaluation; however, you are required in this specific instance to be particularly objective and guard against any tendency that might slant your evaluation in favor of a personal preference.

You are required to report to the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator any actual or potential conflict of interest. In addition, you must report to the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator the existence of any personal relationship with any other offeror or subcontractor of the offeror which could affect or give the appearance of affecting your objectivity.

An additional consideration is the need to maintain strict security regarding the content of any proposal and the proceedings of the Evaluation Committee meetings during the evaluation process. Once the evaluation process has started, it is essential that any contact with the offerors be through, and by, the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator. In addition, the Evaluation Committee Member shall not communicate, except during formal Committee meetings, with any offeror or sub-contractor of the offeror prior to award. This requirement is mandatory.

To emphasize the importance of the above considerations, you are asked to sign the following statement:

I have read and understand the above and agree to be bound by the rules and principles represented. I know of no conflict of interest on my part nor have I committed any indiscretion or accepted any gratuities or favors that would compromise my impartiality. I will maintain all deliberations of the evaluation committee in strict confidence during the evaluation process. My recommendations shall be based upon an objective/subjective review of the offeror's proposal(s) and the appropriate award criteria.

	8-6-19
Signature (rollowed by printed name)	Date
Evaluator	Phone Number

EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEMBER STATEMENT

Solicitation No. RFP # 19-06 Auctioneer Services

Dear Committee Member:

You have been selected to participate in the evaluation of proposals that have been received as the result of the above referenced solicitation. Your selection was based upon your qualifications in this area and your ability to develop an objective analysis of each proposal.

It is essential that the integrity of the evaluation process be maintained to insure that each offeror is given fair and equal consideration. Familiarity with particular companies and/or individuals may tend to influence an evaluation; however, you are required in this specific instance to be particularly objective and guard against any tendency that might slant your evaluation in favor of a personal preference.

You are required to report to the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator any actual or potential conflict of interest. In addition, you must report to the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator the existence of any personal relationship with any other offeror or subcontractor of the offeror which could affect or give the appearance of affecting your objectivity.

An additional consideration is the need to maintain strict security regarding the content of any proposal and the proceedings of the Evaluation Committee meetings during the evaluation process. Once the evaluation process has started, it is essential that any contact with the offerors be through, and by, the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator. In addition, the Evaluation Committee Member shall not communicate, except during formal Committee meetings, with any offeror or sub-contractor of the offeror prior to award. This requirement is mandatory.

To emphasize the importance of the above considerations, you are asked to sign the following statement:

I have read and understand the above and agree to be bound by the rules and principles represented. I know of no conflict of interest on my part nor have I committed any indiscretion or accepted any gratuities or favors that would compromise my impartiality. I will maintain all deliberations of the evaluation committee in strict confidence during the evaluation process. My recommendations shall be based upon an objective/subjective review of the offeror's proposal(s) and the appropriate award criteria.

	7/30/19
Signature (followed by printed name)	Date
_	
Business Operations Specialist	Phone Number

EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEMBER STATEMENT

Solicitation No. RFP # 19-06 Auctioneer Services

Dear Committee Member:

You have been selected to participate in the evaluation of proposals that have been received as the result of the above referenced solicitation. Your selection was based upon your qualifications in this area and your ability to develop an objective analysis of each proposal.

It is essential that the integrity of the evaluation process be maintained to insure that each offeror is given fair and equal consideration. Familiarity with particular companies and/or individuals may tend to influence an evaluation; however, you are required in this specific instance to be particularly objective and guard against any tendency that might slant your evaluation in favor of a personal preference.

You are required to report to the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator any actual or potential conflict of interest. In addition, you must report to the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator the existence of any personal relationship with any other offeror or subcontractor of the offeror which could affect or give the appearance of affecting your objectivity.

An additional consideration is the need to maintain strict security regarding the content of any proposal and the proceedings of the Evaluation Committee meetings during the evaluation process. Once the evaluation process has started, it is essential that any contact with the offerors be through, and by, the Purchasing Cooperative Coordinator. In addition, the Evaluation Committee Member shall not communicate, except during formal Committee meetings, with any offeror or sub-contractor of the offeror prior to award. This requirement is mandatory.

To emphasize the importance of the above considerations, you are asked to sign the following statement:

I have read and understand the above and agree to be bound by the rules and principles represented. I know of no conflict of interest on my part nor have I committed any indiscretion or accepted any

gratuities or favors that would compromise my impa evaluation committee in strict confidence during the e	•
be based upon an objective/subjective review of the	
criteria	
Signature (followed by printed name)	Date
Chief Financial Officer	Phone Number

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)		Offers multiple service options; 12.5% if they collect payments, remits to agency, and liable for bad payments; offers vol. discount over \$1 million sale; fee decreases as size increases; \$5 minimum for sale, no fee for "no sale"; no addn'l fees
2	Performance Capability (30%)	200	Has over 546 Texas gov'ts using their system and over \$88 million in assets for them; over a dozen real-time reports built into on-line auctioneering system; assigns two exper. staff to each agency to assist with sale; 24/7 on-call support
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	18%	18 yrs. experience; 12,000 gov. agencies use their product; 546 Tx. Gov't. units; over \$2 billion in sales over 18 yrs.; has \$25 M insurance policy; 10 references
4	Value Add (10%)	8%	Accepts risk for bad payments; robust reporting and audit trail; extensive marketing outreach
	Totals = 100%	87%	Notes:

	7/29/2019
Evaluator's Name	Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

VENDOR NAME_	GovDeals	

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	28%	Exception may not be acceptable.
2	Performance Capability (30%)	30%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	15%	
4	Value Add (10%)	7%	
	Totals = 100%	80%	Notes:

	8/6/2019
Evaluator's Name	Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

VENDOR NAME GovDeals	
----------------------	--

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	32%	
2	Performance Capability (30%)	25%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	18%	
4	Value Add (10%)	8%	
	Totals = 100%	83%	Notes:

	8/5/2019
Evaluator's Name	Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

Each committee member will independently score each vendor listed as specified in the bid documents. Email to: cwallace@esc4.net when complete.

		_	-			-
VEN	un	м	2,	uД	м	٠

Lemons

Г	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	270/	Offers multiple auction options - from 5% - 18% fully done by auctioneer; auction fee (% of gross sales) deducted from Seller gross proceeds; no chg. if no sale; no charges for advertising, marketing, upgrading and maintaining system and training; has revenue sharing
2	Performance Capability (30%)	27%	Sales from \$3.4 mil \$4 mil.; Company WBE and HUB; 4 sales locations in Tx.; has price consultaion; customer svc. M - F 8 am - 5 pm, CST; team available to tag property
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	16%	18 yrs. experience; an incumbent provider; locally owned and operated auctioneer; provided 4 gov't references;
4	Value Add (10%)	8%	Current members of auctioneering associations; carries significant insurance coverage; has auctioneering facility; has an appraisal company affiliation
Г	Totals = 100%	88%	Notes:

	7/29/2019
Evaluator's Name	Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

VENDOR NAME	Lemons		

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	30%	
2	Performance Capability (30%)	24%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	20%	
4	Value Add (10%)	6%	
	Totals = 100%	80%	Notes:

	8/6/2019
Evaluator's Nam	e Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

VENDOR NAME	Lemons				_
-------------	--------	--	--	--	---

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	35%	
2	Performance Capability (30%)	26%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	18%	
4	Value Add (10%)	7%	
	Totals = 100%	86%	Notes:

8/5/20	
	119

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

Each committee member will independently score each vendor listed as specified in the bid documents. Email to: cwallace@esc4.net when complete.

VENDOR NAME	Lone Star	

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	200/	Offers two auction options - Do-it-yourself, 5% cost to seller and Full-Service, 0% cost to Seller; no vol. discount or revenue sharing; no fees for use of system and implementing, no fees for training or tech. support; sends sales taxes directly to the state for entity;
2	Performance Capability (30%)	27%	Has sold approx. \$112 million in state surplus in the past 26 yrs.; annual sales of \$29.6 mil. in 2016, \$29.5 in 2017, \$34 mil. In 2018; 3 permanent sales force located Ft. Worth
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)		35 yrs. exper.; incumbent provider; continuous contract with the State of Texas for auctioneering svcs. since 1988; highly qualified; no exceptions to the terms and conditions; 5 references
4	Value Add (10%)	7%	Provides full-service online auctions to ESC 4 members; advertises speific auctions in print
	Totals = 100%	90%	Notes:

7/29/2019
Evaluator's Name Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

Lone Star

8%

86%

Notes:

Each committee member will independently score each vendor listed as specified in the bid documents. Email to: cwallace@esc4.net when complete.

VENDOR NAME

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	30%	
2	Performance Capability (30%)	29%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	19%	
_			

	8/6/2019
Evaluator's Name	Date

4 Value Add (10%)

Totals = 100%

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

VENDOR NAME Lone Star	
-----------------------	--

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	35%	
2	Performance Capability (30%)	25%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	18%	
4	Value Add (10%)	8%	
\vdash	Totals = 100%	86%	Notes:

	8/5/2019
Evaluator's Name	Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

Each committee member will independently score each vendor listed as specified in the bid documents. Email to: cwallace@esc4.net when complete.

VENDOR NAME	Public Surplus	
ALIADOK MAME	Public aurplus	

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)		Offers two auction options; 7% fee for services paid by Buyer, 5% for items over \$100K; minimum auction fee of \$1 if Buyer pays via CC; no fee if no sale; no fees fo marketing, training, implementing, tech. support; does not provide "live" auction svcs; no main. or upgrade fees.
2	Performance Capability (30%)	25%	Web based online auctioning system; 16 sales force and two locations - Utah and Nevada, but has two locations in Tx.; avg. \$100 mil. annually in sales; offers two services to collect for agency; can handle sales tax submital in several ways; does "Dutch Auction"; has a revenue rebate for revenue sharing; 5 - 7 million hits per day on website
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	15%	20 yrs.experience; serves 300 + gov't in Texas; 9 references; workds almost exclusively with gov'ts
4	Value Add (10%)	5%	Can create, review, edit auctions straight from mobile device; has auction extension feature
	Totals = 100%	80%	Notes:

7/29/2019 Evaluator's Name Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

VENDOR NAME	Public Surplus	

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	35%	
2	Performance Capability (30%)	25%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	15%	
4	Value Add (10%)	2%	
\vdash	Totals = 100%	77%	Notes:

		8/6/2019
Evaluator	s Name	Date

Auctioneer Services

COMMITTEE MEMBER INDIVIDUAL VENDOR SCORING CHART

VENDOR NAME	Public Surplus		

	Rating Factors	Score %	Rationale for Score
1	Products/Pricing (40%)	32%	
2	Performance Capability (30%)	25%	
3	Qualification and Experience (20%)	15%	
4	Value Add (10%)	5%	
	Totals = 100%	77%	Notes:

	8/5/2019
Evaluator's Name	Date